

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	v
Acknowledgements	vii
Selected Abbreviations	xvii
Clarification concerning the sources	xix
General Introduction	1
1 Introductory remarks: An 'obligations approach'	1
1.1 Obstacles to an 'obligations approach'	6
1.2 A new momentum	9
1.2.1 Developments in the field of economic, social and cultural rights	9
1.2.2 The work of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	11
1.2.3 The Typologies of States' obligations under human rights treaties	12
2 Structure of the study	13
3 Preliminary outline of the different categories of State obligations on the basis of the Covenant's structure	15
4 The importance of focusing on the obligations imposed by Part II of the Covenant	18
5 The 'violations' and 'obligations' approaches. The necessity to merge the two approaches	20
6 Scope of the present study	22
7 A note on terminology and sources	24

PART ONE**THE ROLE OF THE COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS IN CLARIFYING THE NORMATIVE CONTENT OF THE COVENANT****Chapter I****The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights** 29

1	Introduction	29
2	The establishment of the Committee	29
3	Brief overview of the Committee's working methods	33
3.1	Consideration of State Reports	34
3.1.1	State Reports	34
3.1.2	The pre-sessional working group and the 'list of issues'	35
3.1.3	The Constructive Dialogue	36
3.1.4	The Concluding Observations	36
3.2	General Comments	40
3.3	Days of general discussion	42
3.4	Follow-up	43
3.5	Non-submission and considerably overdue reports	44

Chapter II**The Covenant in a changing international environment** 45

1	Introduction	45
2	Developments in the field of economic, social and cultural rights	46
2.1	Increased number of international instruments aimed at the protection of economic, social and cultural rights	46
2.2	The development of economic, social and cultural rights through the work of the UN Treaty bodies	52
2.3	The increased attention paid by UN Charter bodies, specialised agencies and UN Conferences	58
2.3.1	The UN Commission on Human Rights and the Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights	58
2.3.2	Specialised Agencies	61
2.3.3	The UN Conferences	62
2.4	The contribution of scholarly writers	64
2.5	The contribution of NGOs	66
3	The role of the Committee in light of new developments	67
4	Concluding Comments	70

Chapter III**The Committee's interpretation of the obligations imposed by the Covenant** 73

1	Introduction	73
2	The Committee's interpretation of the Covenant under the general rules of interpretation of human rights treaties	73
2.1	Introduction	73
2.2	General overview of the rules of interpretation of international treaties	74
2.3	The specific object and purpose of human rights treaties	77
2.3.1	The effectiveness rule	79
2.3.2	The evolutive interpretation	81
2.4	The Committee's approach to the rules of interpretation	84
3	The legitimacy of the Committee's interpretation of the Covenant	87
3.1	Introduction	87
3.2	The Committee's legal standing	89
3.3	The 'legitimacy' of the Committee's work	91
3.3.1	Independence and expertise of members	91
3.3.2	Diversity of membership	94
3.3.3	Continuity and coherence	96
3.3.4	Predictability	97
3.3.5	Efficiency	98
3.3.6	Objectivity	105
3.3.7	Reasonableness and practicability	107
3.3.8	Support received from other international bodies	107
3.4	Concluding Comments on the legitimacy of the Committee	110
4	Concluding Comments	111

PART TWO**THE OBLIGATIONS IMPOSED BY THE COVENANT****Chapter IV****The Nature of States Party Obligations under the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights** 115

1	Introduction	115
2	The drafting history of the Covenants and the alleged difference in nature of the rights and obligations	116
2.1	The adoption of two separate Covenants and the different wording used in articles 2(1) of each Covenant	116

2.2	Re-examining the alleged difference in nature among States' obligations	122
2.2.1	Positive/negative obligations	123
2.2.2	Cost-free obligations/expensive obligations	126
2.2.3	Progressive/immediate obligations	128
2.2.4	Vague/precise obligations	131
2.3	The present significance of the differences in wording of articles 2(1) of each Covenant	133
2.3.1	The meaning of article 2(1) ICESCR	133
2.3.2	The meaning of the State obligation to 'respect and ensure'	134
3	The spectrum of State obligations	137
3.1	Introduction	137
3.2	The concept of a spectrum of State obligations	138
3.3	A concrete example: the right to life and State obligations	138
3.4	Concluding comments on the spectrum of obligations arising from the right to life	153
4	Concluding Comments	155
Chapter V		
The typologies of State duties imposed by the Covenant		157
1	Types of State duties imposed by human rights treaties	157
1.1	Introduction	157
1.2	The tripartite typology: its evolution	157
1.2.1	Shue's tripartite typology: Duties of avoidance, protection and aid	158
1.2.2	Eide's analysis: Obligation to respect, protect and fulfil	161
1.2.3	Van Hoof's analysis: Additional obligation to promote	163
1.2.4	Steiner and Alston's proposal of five levels of obligations	163
1.3	Evaluation of the different typologies of State obligations imposed by human rights norms	165
1.3.1	Comparative commentary	165
1.3.2	The advantage of the use of typologies	169
2	The approach of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights to typologies of State Party obligations	173
2.1	Introduction	173
2.2	The typologies referred to by the Committee	174
2.3	Obligations of immediacy and obligations of progressive realisation	174
2.3.1	Immediate/progressive obligations in the Committee's General Comments	175

2.3.2	Immediate/progressive obligations in the Committee's Concluding Observations	179
2.3.3	Concluding comments on the immediate/progressive typology	183
2.4	Obligations of conduct and obligations of result	184
2.4.1	The meaning of 'obligations of conduct' and 'obligations of result' in international law	185
2.4.2	State obligations imposed by human rights and the conduct/result typology	187
2.4.3	Concluding comments on the conduct/result typology	195
2.5	The application of the tripartite typology by the Committee in its General Comments	196
2.5.1	The Committee's understanding of the tripartite typology	196
2.5.2	The application of the tripartite typology to specific rights	201
2.5.3	Comments on the approach of the Committee to the tripartite typology in the General Comments	206
3	The tripartite typology in the Concluding Observations	209
3.1	Introduction	209
3.2	Obligation to respect	212
3.3	Obligation to protect	222
3.4	Obligation to fulfil	239
3.4.1	Obligation to fulfil (facilitate)	239
3.4.2	Obligation to fulfil (provide)	241
3.4.3	Obligation to fulfil (promote)	243
3.5	Concluding Comments on the use of the tripartite typology in the Concluding Observations	246
4	Concluding Comments	247

PART THREE**OBLIGATIONS IMPOSED BY PART II OF THE COVENANT AT THE PRESENT STAGE OF INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW****Chapter VI****General survey of Part II Obligations**

1	Obligations imposed by Part II of the Covenant	251
1.1	Introduction	251
1.2	The question of the nature and nomenclature of obligations enshrined in Part II of the Covenant	256

2	Selected issues under Part II of the Covenant	259
2.1	The personal scope of the Covenant	259
2.1.1	The Committee's approach in the General Comments	261
2.1.2	The Committee's approach in the Concluding Observations	262
2.1.3	Concluding comments	271
2.2	The territorial scope of the ICESCR	272
2.2.1	The Committee's approach in the General Comments	273
2.2.2	The Committee's approach in the Concluding Observations	273
2.2.3	Concluding comments	276
3	General limitation clause (article 4 ICESCR)	277
3.1	The Committee's approach to article 4 ICESCR in the General Comments	285
3.2	The Committee's approach to article 4 ICESCR in the Concluding Observations	286
3.3	Concluding comments on the Committee's approach to article 4 ICESCR	292
3.4	The absence of a non-derogation provision	293
4	The principles of interpretation contained in article 5 ICESCR	303
4.1	The prohibition of abuse of rights (article 5 paragraph 1)	304
4.2	The savings clause (article 5 paragraph 2)	306
4.3	Other interpretative provisions contained in the Covenant	308
4.4	Concluding Comments on the Committee's approach to article 5 ICESCR	309

Chapter VII

Analysis of article 2(1) of the ICESCR

1	Introduction	311
2	The obligation to take steps and to devote the maximum of available resources	313
2.1	Measuring State compliance with the obligation to devote the maximum available resources	316
3	The obligation to continuously improve conditions and the prohibition of taking deliberately retrogressive measures	319
3.1	The obligation to continuously improve conditions	319
3.2	The prohibition of taking deliberately retrogressive measures	323
4	The obligation to accord a degree of priority to human rights in the allocation of resources	332

5	The obligation to take 'all appropriate' measures towards the full implementation of the rights	335
5.1	Legislative measures	339
5.1.1	The validity of the Covenant in the domestic legal system	341
5.1.2	Direct applicability of the Covenant (self-executing)	343
5.1.3	Indispensable legislative measures	346
5.2	Judicial or other 'appropriate' remedies	354
5.2.1	Judicial remedies	355
5.2.2	Other effective remedies	358
5.3	Information campaigns and educational programmes	359
6	The obligation to monitor the realisation of the rights and to devise strategies and programmes for their implementation	360
6.1	Obligation to monitor the enjoyment of the Covenant rights	362
6.2	Obligation to devise and adopt a plan of action	364
7	The obligation to ensure the minimum core level for each right	365
8	Obligations regarding international assistance and co-operation	370
8.1	Developed States	372
8.2	Developing States	376
9	Concluding Comments	377

Chapter VIII

Obligations deriving from the principle of equality and non-discrimination

1	Introduction	379
2	The meaning and scope of the non-discrimination provisions of the Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	380
2.1	The scope of the non-discrimination provision	380
2.2	The meaning of 'discrimination'	381
2.3	Distinctions, protective and affirmative action	383
2.4	Direct and indirect discrimination	388
2.5	Discrimination by private actors	389
3	Article 2(2): Non-discrimination	391
3.1	Grounds covered by the provision	391
3.2	Immediate character of the obligation of non-discrimination	395
3.3	Obligations deriving from the principle of non-discrimination	397
4	Article 3: Equal rights of men and women	404
4.1	The necessity to reaffirm article 2(2) on the ground of sex	404
4.2	The Committee's supervision of article 3	406

4.3	Obligations deriving from article 3	407
4.4	Obligation to combat domestic violence	410
5	Article 2(3): Non-nationals in developing countries	414
6	An integrated approach to non-discrimination	415
7	Concluding Comments	418
Chapter IX		
Summary and Concluding Observations		421
1	Summary	421
2	The time for an 'obligations approach'	427
3	A future optional protocol to the Covenant and the obligations approach	429
4	Future improvements for the normative clarification of the Covenant	430
5	Future challenges to the protection of economic, social and cultural rights	433
	Selected Bibliography	437
	Selected Documents	457
	Table of Cases	461
	Index	467