

# **Constitutional Dilemmas Conflicts of Fundamental Legal Rights in Europe and the USA Lorenzo Zucca**



## **Description**

This book deals with one of the most important issues of philosophy of law and constitutional thought: how to understand clashes of fundamental rights, such as the conflict between free speech and privacy. The main argument of this book is that much can be learned about the nature of fundamental legal rights by examining them through the lens of conflicts among such rights, and criticizing the views of scholars and jurists who have discussed both fundamental legal rights and the nature of conflicts among them.

Theories of rights are necessarily abstract, aiming at providing the best possible answers to pressing social problems. Yet such theories must also respond to the real and changing dilemmas of the day. Taking up the problem of conflicting rights, Zucca seeks a theory of rights that can guide us to a richer, more responsive approach to rights discourse.

The idea of constitutional rights is one of the most powerful tools to advance justice in the Western tradition. But as this book demonstrates, even the most ambitious theory of rights cannot satisfactorily address questions of conflicting rights. How, for instance, can we fully secure privacy when it clashes with free speech? To what extent can our societies assist people in dying without compromising the protection of life? Exploring the limitations of the rights discourse in these areas, Zucca questions the role of law in settling ethical dilemmas helping to clarify thinking about the limitations of rights discourse.

# Contents

## Introduction

ix

## PART I: THE THEORY OF CONFLICTS OF FUNDAMENTAL LEGAL RIGHTS

<b>1. Law, Morality, and Conflicts of Fundamental Legal Rights</b>	<b>3</b>
1. The Dilemma	3
2. The Structure of FLRs' Norms: Rules v Principles	7
3. Weighing Principles in Competition: Harmony or Conflict?	12
4. Conflicts of FLRs: From Morality to Law	23
5. Conclusion	25
<b>2. The Concept of Fundamental Legal Rights</b>	<b>27</b>
1. FLRs and Analysis	27
2. A Preliminary Problem: Reductionism	27
3. The Structure and Point of Rights	29
4. The Scope (or Content) of FLRs	42
5. The External Dimension or the Function(s) of FLRs	45
6. FLRs: A Stipulative Definition	47
<b>3. The Anatomy of Conflicts of Fundamental Legal Rights</b>	<b>49</b>
1. Introduction	49
2. <i>Lato Sensu</i> and Spurious Conflicts of FLRs	49
3. The Core of Conflicts of FLRs	52
4. Theories of Rights, Normative Inconsistencies, and Incommensurability	55
5. Beyond Absolute or Prima Facie FLRs	60
6. A Typology of Conflicts of FLRs	64
<b>4. A Framework to Deal with Conflicts of Fundamental Legal Rights</b>	<b>67</b>
1. Why a Framework?	67
2. Conflicts and the Constitution	68
3. Interpretation and Conflicts of FLRs	74
4. Deference and Conflicts of FLRs	79

5. Balancing and Conflicts of FLRs	84
6. The Rule of Conflict as the Ultimate Rule of Law	90

## PART II: THE PRACTICE OF CONFLICTS OF FUNDAMENTAL LEGAL RIGHTS

<b>Introduction</b>	97
<b>5. The Fundamental Legal Right to Privacy</b>	99
1. Privacy: An Ambiguous Concept	99 *
2. The Structure of the FLR to Privacy	101
3. The Legal Protection of the FLR to Privacy	107
4. Conflicts and the FLR to Privacy	112
<b>6. The Fundamental Legal Right to Informational Privacy v     The Fundamental Legal Right to Free Press</b>	114
1. Introduction	114
2. Situating the Conflict	115
3. Solving the Conflict?	131
<b>7. Mortal Conflicts of Fundamental Legal Rights—The     Fundamental Legal Right to Life v The Fundamental     Legal Right to Decisional Privacy</b>	142
1. Introduction	142
2. Physician-assisted Suicide Around the World	145
3. The Anatomy of a FLRs Conflict	148
4. Moral and Legal Conflicts	156
5. Whose Tragedy Is It?	160
6. Present Solutions: How do Courts Solve the Conflict?	162
7. Accepting or Imposing Sacrifices	166
<b>8. Conclusion</b>	168
<i>Bibliography</i>	171
<i>Index</i>	179