

Law of the European Convention on Human Rights

DJ Harris LLM, PhD (London)
Professor of Public International Law,
University of Nottingham

M O'Boyle LLB (Belf), LLM (Harvard)
Barrister-at-Law (Inn of Court of
Northern Ireland), Senior Legal Officer
at the European Court of Human Rights

C Warbrick MA, LLB (Cantab), LLM (Michigan)
Senior Lecturer in Law,
University of Durham

Butterworths
London, Dublin, Edinburgh
1995

Contents

Preface	v
Note on the citation of Strasbourg cases	xv
List of abbreviations	xvii
Table of statutes	xxi
Table of European legislation and international/UN conventions	xxiii
List of European Court of Human Rights cases	xxxii
Alphabetical list of European Commission of Human Rights cases	xli
Numerical list of European Commission of Human Rights cases	li
List of other cases	lxi

Chapter 1 The European Convention on Human Rights in context 1

1. Background 1
2. The substantive guarantee 3
3. The Strasbourg enforcement machinery 5
4. The interpretation of the Convention 5
5. Negative and positive obligations and *drittwirkung* 19
6. Reservations 22
7. The Convention in national law 23
8. The Convention and the European Union 27
9. Achievements and prospects 28

Chapter 2 Article 2: The right to life 37

1. The obligation to protect the right to life by law 38
2. Prohibition of the taking of life 44
3. Conclusion 54

Chapter 3 Article 3: Freedom from torture or inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment 55

1. Introduction 55
2. Torture 59
3. Inhuman treatment 61
4. Inhuman punishment 80
5. Degrading treatment 80

6. Degrading punishment 84
7. Conclusion 88

Chapter 4 Article 4: Freedom from slavery, servitude or forced or compulsory labour 90

1. Freedom from slavery and servitude 90
2. Freedom from forced or compulsory labour 92
3. Permitted work or services 94

Chapter 5 Article 5: The right to liberty and security of the person 97

1. Article 5(1): Generally 97
2. Cases in which detention is permitted 104
3. Article 5(2): Reasons for arrest to be given 128
4. Article 5(3): Pre-trial detention and trial within a reasonable time 131
5. Article 5(4): Remedy to challenge the legality of detention 145
6. Article 5(5): Right to compensation for illegal detention 158
7. Conclusion 160

Chapter 6 Article 6: The right to a fair trial 163

1. Article 6: Generally 164
2. Field of application 166
3. Article 6(1): Guarantees in criminal and non-criminal cases 196
4. Article 6(2): The right to be presumed innocent in criminal cases 241
5. Article 6(3): Further guarantees in criminal cases 249
6. Conclusion 272

Chapter 7 Article 7: Freedom from retroactive criminal offences and punishment 274

1. *Ex post facto* criminal offences 275
2. *Ex post facto* criminal penalties 280
3. General principles of law exception 281

Chapter 8 Articles 8-11: General considerations 283

1. Introduction 283
2. Negative and positive obligations 284
3. Limitations 285
4. Conclusion 301

Chapter 9 Article 8: The right to respect for private and family life, home and correspondence 302

1. Introduction 302
2. The four interests protected by Article 8(1) 305
3. 'Respect' 320
4. Article 8(2): Justification for interference with Article 8(1) rights 335
5. Conclusion 353

Chapter 10 Article 9: Freedom of religion 356

1. What rights are protected? 356
2. Freedom of thought, conscience and religion: the right to believe 360
3. Manifesting religion or belief in worship, teaching, practice and observance 363
4. Justifiable interferences 365
5. Conscientious objection 368
6. Conclusion 370

Chapter 11 Article 10: Freedom of expression 372

1. Introduction 372
2. Freedom of expression: what is protected? 377
3. Interference with freedom of expression 386
4. Conclusion 414

Chapter 12 Article 11: Freedom of assembly and association 417

1. Freedom of peaceful assembly 418
2. Freedom of association 421
3. Freedom to form and join trade unions 424
4. Restrictions on public service employees 430
5. Conclusion 432

Chapter 13 Article 12: The right to marry and to found a family 435

1. Introduction 435
2. The right to marry 436
3. The right to found a family 440
4. Non-married persons 442

Chapter 14 Article 13: The right to an effective national remedy 443

1. A pre-emptive remedy 444
2. An auxiliary remedy 445
3. The requirement of a 'claim' of a Convention violation 446
4. An 'arguable' claim 447
5. A remedy before a national authority 449
6. An effective remedy 450
7. The 'state action' problem 460
8. Conclusion 461

Chapter 15 Article 14: Freedom from discrimination in respect of protected rights 462

1. The relation between the obligation of non-discrimination and the enjoyment of the rights and freedoms in the Convention 464
2. Differential treatment and analogous situations 470
3. The concept of discrimination 475
4. Conclusion 486

Chapter 16 Article 15: Derogation in time of war or other public emergency 489

1. Introduction 489
2. The general pattern of Article 15 490
3. 'In time of war or other public emergency threatening the life of the nation' 491
4. 'Measures . . . to the extent strictly required by the exigencies of the situation . . .' 496
5. Other international law obligations 502
6. Article 15(2): The non-derogable provisions 503
7. The procedural requirements: Article 15(3) 505
8. The French reservation 506

Chapter 17 Articles 16-18: Other restrictions upon the rights protected 508

1. Article 16: Restrictions on the political rights of aliens 508
2. Article 17: Restrictions on activities subversive of Convention rights 510
3. Article 18: Prohibition of the use of restrictions for an improper purpose 513

Chapter 18 Article 1, First Protocol: The right to property 516

1. Introduction 516
2. The structure of Article 1, First Protocol and the inter-relationship of its provisions 521
3. Article 1/1/1: Interference with the peaceful enjoyment of possessions 523
4. Article 1/1/2: Deprivation of property 527
5. Article 1/2: Control of use 534
6. Conclusion 538

Chapter 19 Article 2, First Protocol: The right to education 540

1. Introduction 540
2. The basic obligation 542
3. Respect for parents' religious and philosophical convictions 544
4. Discrimination and minority rights 547

Chapter 20 Article 3, First Protocol: The right to free elections 550**Chapter 21 Rights protected by the Fourth, Sixth and Seventh Protocols to the Convention 558**

1. Article 1, Fourth Protocol: Freedom from imprisonment for non-fulfilment of a contractual obligation 558
2. Article 2, Fourth Protocol: Freedom of movement within a state and freedom to leave its territory 559
3. Article 3, Fourth Protocol: The right of a national not to be expelled from and to enter a state's territory 562

4. Article 4, Fourth Protocol: Freedom of aliens from collective expulsion 563
5. Sixth Protocol: Freedom from the death penalty 564
6. Article 1, Seventh Protocol: Freedom from expulsion of individual aliens 565
7. Article 2, Seventh Protocol: The right to review in criminal cases 566
8. Article 3, Seventh Protocol: Right to compensation for miscarriages of justice 567
9. Article 4, Seventh Protocol: *Ne bis in idem* 568
10. Article 5, Seventh Protocol: Equality of rights of spouses 569

Chapter 22 The European Commission of Human Rights: Practice and procedure 571

1. Composition, election and independence 571
2. Role of the Commission 573
3. Organisation and functioning of the Commission 575
4. Right of individual petition 580
5. Inter-state applications 585
6. Procedure before the Commission 587
7. Conclusion 603

Chapter 23 Admissibility of applications 604

1. Application of admissibility requirements to inter-state cases 604
2. Exhaustion of domestic remedies 608
3. The six-month rule 621
4. Other grounds of inadmissibility 624
5. Incompatibility and the competence of the Commission 629

Chapter 24 The operation of the European Court of Human Rights 648

1. Composition and independence of the Court 649
2. The referral of cases to the Court and acceptance of compulsory jurisdiction 652
3. Relinquishment of jurisdiction: chambers, grand chambers and plenary 654
4. Procedure before the Court 656
5. Jurisdiction of the Court 671
6. Establishing the facts and the burden of proof 678
7. Friendly settlement and discontinuance 680
8. Just satisfaction under Article 50 682
9. Interpretation and revision of a judgment 688
10. Advisory opinions 689

Chapter 25 The role of the Committee of Ministers 691

1. Decision-making under Article 32 691

xiv *Contents*

2. Supervising the execution of the Court's judgments
(Article 54) 700
3. Conclusion 705

Chapter 26 Reforming the Convention: Eleventh Protocol 706

1. The background to the Eleventh Protocol 706
2. The operation of the new single Court 708
3. Assessment 711

**Appendix I European Commission of Human Rights and European Court
of Human Rights members on 31 December 1994 715**

Appendix II Table of applications in 1993/94 717

Index 719