
The American Convention on Human Rights

ESSENTIAL RIGHTS

Thomas M. Antkowiak

Alejandra Gonza

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

The American Convention on Human Rights. Thomas M. Antkowiak and Alejandra Gonza.
© Oxford University Press 2017. Published 2017 by Oxford University Press.

Contents

I. Introduction 1

I. Overview of Book 1

II. The Inter-American Human Rights System's Impact, Major Institutions, and Legal Instruments 2

A. Impact and Importance of the Inter-American System 2

B. The Organization of American States, the American Convention, and Other Critical Human Rights Instruments 5

C. The Inter-American Commission on Human Rights 8

D. The Inter-American Court of Human Rights 11

1. Introduction 11

2. The Court in Relation to the Commission 13

3. The Court's *Ratione Materiae*, *Ratione Temporis*, *Ratione Personae*, and *Ratione Loci* Jurisdiction 14

4. Note on the Court's Assessment of Evidence and Burden of Proof 17

III. Key Developments and Critiques of the Inter-American Jurisprudence 18

A. Introduction 18

B. Extensive State Obligations to Respect and Ensure Rights 18

C. Article 63: Reparations 19

D. Article 24: Right to Equality 20

E. Article 4: Right to Life 21

F. Article 5: Right to Humane Treatment 22

G. Article 7: Right to Personal Liberty 23

H. Rights to Due Process and Judicial Protection 24

1. Article 8: Right to a Fair Trial 24

2. Article 25: Right to Judicial Protection 25

I. Article 13: Freedom of Expression	25
J. Article 21: Right to Property	26
IV. The Book's Structure and Methodology	27
2. <i>Equality</i>	31
<i>Article 24: Right to Equal Protection</i>	31
I. Introduction	32
II. Background	35
III. Scope of Protection	36
A. The Relationship of Article 24 and Article 1	36
B. The Assessment of Discrimination	40
1. Definitions and State Obligations	40
2. The Progression of the Court's Case Law: Discrimination in Law and in Fact	43
a. Introduction	43
b. Perceived Political Opponents	44
c. Disadvantaged Groups	45
d. Synthesis	48
3. <i>Atala Riffo</i> and the Court's Current Approach to Discrimination	49
3. <i>Life</i>	55
<i>Article 4: Right to Life</i>	55
I. Introduction	57
II. Background	59
III. Extensive State Obligations to Respect and Ensure the Right to Life	61
A. Introduction	61
B. Duty to Respect	62
C. Duty to Ensure (or "Protect")	65
1. Overview	65
2. Duty to Prevent through Legal Regulation	66
3. Duty to Adopt "Prevention and Protection Measures" in Threatening Circumstances	67
4. Duty to Investigate and Punish	68
IV. Scope of Protection	72
A. Meaning of "Every Person" and "In General, From the Moment of Conception"	72
B. Meaning of "No One Shall Be Arbitrarily Deprived" of Life	75
1. The Death Penalty	76
a. Introduction	76
b. "Only For The Most Serious Crimes"	77
c. The "Mandatory" Death Penalty	77

d. Due Process Requirements	78
e. Right to Apply for Pardon, Amnesty, or Commutation	81
2. Use of Lethal Force in Law Enforcement Scenarios	82
a. Introduction	82
b. The Principles of Legality, Necessity, and Proportionality	83
c. The Burden of Proof	85
d. State Duties after the Use of Force	85
3. Use of Lethal Force in Armed Conflicts	86
4. Arbitrary Deprivation of Life of Imprisoned Individuals	89
a. Introduction	89
b. Detention Conditions and Healthcare	90
c. Security Operations in Prisons	91
5. Forced Disappearances of Persons	92
a. Introduction and Definition	92
b. The Right to Life and <i>Ratione Temporis</i> Jurisdiction	94
C. The Concept of <i>Vida Digna</i>	97
4. <i>Humane Treatment</i>	101
<i>Article 5: Right to Humane Treatment</i>	101
I. Introduction	103
II. Background	105
III. Scope of Protection	106
A. A Broad Right with Uncertain Parameters	106
B. Definitions of Torture and the Inter-American Convention to Prevent and Punish Torture	108
C. The Inter-American Court's Three-Part Test for Torture	110
D. Involvement of State Actors: A Fourth Requirement?	114
E. Considerations of Evidence and Proof	116
F. Cruel, Inhuman, or Degrading Punishment or Treatment	117
1. Introduction	117
2. Sexual Violence and Violence against Women	118
3. State-Sanctioned Punishment	120
a. Corporal Punishment	120
b. The Death Penalty	120
c. Life Imprisonment: Children	121
4. Detention Conditions and Practices	122
5. Forced Disappearance	125
6. Threats of "Severe Physical Injuries"	126
7. Treatment of Children	127
G. Violations to Personal Integrity below the Threshold of Article 5(2)	127

H. Investigation and Prevention: State Obligations to Ensure the Rights of Article 5	130
I. Article 5(3): No Extension of Punishment beyond the Convicted Individual	132
J. Article 5(4): Separate Location and Treatment for Unconvicted Persons in Detention	132
K. Article 5(5): Separate Proceedings and Facilities for Children in the Criminal Justice System	134
L. Article 5(6): "Reform and Social Readaptation" of Prisoners	135
 5. <i>Personal Liberty</i>	139
Article 7: <i>Right to Personal Liberty</i>	139
I. Introduction	141
II. Background	142
III. Scope of Protection	143
A. Overview	143
1. Right to Physical Liberty	143
2. Right to Personal Security	146
B. General Requirements to Deprive Liberty: The Principles of Legality and Arbitrariness	148
1. The Legality Principle	148
a. Restriction of Liberty Always the Exception	148
b. Ordered by a Competent Judicial Authority	150
i. Synthesis	150
ii. Detentions without Judicial Warrants: Exceptional Cases	151
c. State Obligation to Register Detentions	153
d. Detention Time Limits and Orders for Release	154
e. Pretrial Detention as Illegal Detention	154
f. Court's Increasing Reluctance to Find Violations of Article 7(2)	154
2. The Arbitrariness Principle	156
a. Synthesis	156
b. Forced Disappearances	156
c. Pretrial Detention as Arbitrary Detention	157
i. Sufficient Evidence of Criminal Responsibility	158
ii. Risks to the Criminal Proceeding	158
iii. Detention in Immigration Proceedings	159
iv. Pretrial Detention of Special Sectors of the Population	159
v. Time Limits for Pretrial Detention	160
3. Methodological Problems: Legality and Arbitrariness	160
C. The Specific Requirements of Paragraphs 4, 5, and 6 of Article 7	162
1. Article 7(4): Reasons for Detention and Notification of Charges	162
a. Reasons for Detention	162

b. Notification of Charges	163
2. Article 7(5): Judicial Supervision	164
a. Brought "Before a Judge or Other Officer Authorized by Law"	164
b. Right to Trial "Within a Reasonable Time"	166
3. Article 7(6): The Right to Habeas Corpus	167
4. Article 7(7): "No One Shall Be Detained for Debt"	169
 6. <i>Due Process and Judicial Protection</i>	171
Article 8: <i>Right to a Fair Trial</i>	171
I. Introduction	174
A. Many Similarities among the Major Human Rights Treaties	174
B. Variances among the Human Rights Systems	176
C. Background	177
II. Article 8(1)	178
A. Introduction and Meaning of "Right to a Hearing"	178
B. Meaning of "With Due Guarantees"	181
C. Meaning of "Within a Reasonable Time"	183
D. Meaning of "Competent, Independent, and Impartial Tribunal, Previously Established by Law"	188
1. "Tribunal"	188
2. "Competent"	188
3. "Independent"	190
4. "Impartial"	191
5. "Previously Established by Law"	193
III. Article 8(2) and the Right to Be Presumed Innocent	194
A. Article 8(2)(a): The Right to be Assisted by a Translator or Interpreter	196
B. Article 8(2)(b): Prior Notification in Detail of Charges	197
C. Article 8(2)(c): Adequate Time and Means for Preparation of Defense	199
D. Article 8(2)(d): The Right to Defend Oneself Personally or to Be Assisted by Legal Counsel, and to Communicate Freely and Privately with Counsel	200
E. Article 8(2)(e): The Right to be Assisted by Counsel Provided by the State	202
F. Article 8(2)(f): The Right of the Defense to Present and Examine Witnesses	204
G. Article 8(2)(g) and Article 8(3): The Right Not to Be Compelled to Be a Witness against Oneself; Coercion and Confessions	206
H. Article 8(2)(h): The Right to Appeal a Judgment to a Higher Court	208
I. The Right to Effective Access to Consular Assistance	210
IV. Article 8(4): An Acquitted Person Shall Not Be Subjected to a New Trial for the Same Cause	211
V. Article 8(5): Public Criminal Proceedings	213

Article 25: Right to Judicial Protection 215

- I. Introduction and Background 216
- II. Article 25(1): "Simple, Prompt and Effective" Remedies 218
 - A. "Simple" and "Prompt" Remedies 218
 - B. "Effective" Remedies 220
- III. Article 25(2): Enforcement of National Judgments 223
- IV. The Boundaries of "Judicial Protection" 224
 - A. The Right of Access to Justice 224
 - B. Combining Articles 8 and 25: A Critique 225
 - C. The Court's Current, Broader View of Article 25 227

7. *Freedom of Expression* 229*Article 13: Freedom of Thought and Expression* 229

- I. Introduction 231
- II. Background 234
- III. Scope of Protection 235
 - A. Meaning of "Everyone" 235
 - B. Protected Expression 237
 - C. Safeguards for Journalists 239
 - D. Right of Access to State-Held Information 241
- IV. Limitations to Article 13 243
 - A. Introduction 243
 - B. Prior Censorship 244
 - 1. Overview 244
 - 2. Prohibitions against Offensive Content 245
 - C. Subsequent Imposition of Liability 247
 - 1. Overview and General Requirements 247
 - 2. Subsequent Criminal Liability 249
 - a. Introduction 249
 - b. The Honor and Reputation of the Armed Forces 252
 - c. The Honor and Reputation of Public Officials 253
 - 3. Subsequent Civil Liability 256
 - D. "Indirect" Restrictions 257
 - E. Cases of Persecution Leading to Generic Violations of Article 13(1) 259
 - F. Incitements to Violence: Article 13(5) 260

8. *Property* 263*Article 21: Right to Property* 263

- I. Introduction 265
- II. Background 267

III. Scope of Protection 268

- A. Many Forms of Property Recognized 268
- B. Rights to Communal Property 271

IV. Limitations to the Right to Property 273

- A. Right to Property Not Absolute 273
- B. Meaning of "Just Compensation" 275
- C. Meaning of "Reasons of Public Utility or Social Interest" 276
- D. Meaning of "In the Cases and According to the Forms Established by Law" 278
- E. Specific Approaches to Limitations 278
 - 1. Restrictions during Criminal Investigations and Police Action 278
 - 2. Protective Framework for Traditional Territories 279

9. *Reparations* 285*Article 63* 285

- I. Introduction 287
- II. Background 289
- III. The "Injured Party" of Article 63(1) and Related Topics 290
- IV. Monetary Remedies 292
 - A. Pecuniary Damages 292
 - B. Moral Damages 296
 - 1. In General 296
 - 2. Community Development Programs 299
- V. Non-Monetary Remedies 300
 - A. Background 300
 - B. Restitution 301
 - C. Rehabilitation 303
 - D. Recognition of Responsibility and Apologies 304
 - E. Memorials and Commemorations 304
 - F. Reform of Legislation and Policy, Training Programs 305
- VI. Legal Fees and Expenses 307
- VII. Supervision and Compliance with the Court's Judgments 308
 - A. Binding and Final Nature of Judgments 308
 - B. Introduction to Supervision 310
 - C. Cases of Noncompliance 311
 - D. Compliance Rates 313
- VIII. Provisional Measures of Article 63(2) 314

APPENDIX: LIST OF INTER-AMERICAN COURT JUDGMENTS BY AMERICAN
CONVENTION ARTICLE: ARTICLES 2-26 317

INDEX 405